

# Editors' Introduction

Micah Sherr  
Georgetown University  
Washington, DC, USA  
micah.sherr@georgetown.edu

Zubair Shafiq  
University of California, Davis  
Davis, CA, USA  
zubair@ucdavis.edu

It is our great pleasure to introduce Issue 3 of Volume 2024 of the Proceedings on Privacy Enhancing Technologies (PoPETs). PoPETs is a journal that publishes articles accepted to the annual Privacy Enhancing Technologies Symposium (PETS). To contribute to the free availability of scientific publications, PoPETs is published under the open-access Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs license.

PoPETs/PETS uses a hybrid conference-journal model, one that has since been adopted by many other conferences in the field. In this model, articles are published throughout the year at regular intervals, and the papers for the year are then presented at an annual conference. Reviewers can request revisions of submitted articles, which may then be revised and resubmitted in the same year. PoPETs publishes four issues per year. By enabling resubmission across these issues, PoPETs provides a high-quality peer-review process that enables authors and reviewers to work together to produce and recognize significant scholarly contributions.

The PoPETs double-blind peer-review process is similar to other top-tier computer-security publications. The process includes initial review by the Editors-in-Chief for rules compliance and in-scope content, written reviews by multiple independent reviewers, author rebuttal, discussion among reviewers, and consensus decisions with disagreements resolved by the Editors-in-Chief or the Vice Chairs. The output of the review process is a set of reviews, a meta-review summarizing the reviewers' opinions after discussion (for papers that are not rejected during the first round), and one of the following decisions: Accept, Accept with Minor Revisions, Major Revisions, Reject and Resubmit, and Reject.

Reviewing by the Editorial Board is performed in two rounds. In the first round, the Editors-in-Chief assign two reviewers from the Regular Editorial Board and a Vice Chair to all papers, and at the end of the round early decisions are made to reject certain papers that have two reject scores (Reject or Reject and Resubmit) from the reviewers. The remaining papers receive additional reviews in the second round for a total of four reviews (in a few cases, submissions received fewer or more reviews). One of the assigned reviewers is appointed as a meta-reviewer, who guides and summarizes the discussion into a meta-review and a decision recommendation.

Some articles had an external review drawn from a pool of junior experts nominated by the community<sup>1</sup> or identified by a member of the Editorial Board as a qualified reviewer. All reviews were sent to the authors of papers that proceeded to the second round of

review, and those authors were invited to provide a written rebuttal to the reviews. After the rebuttal period there was a discussion among the reviewers, the meta-reviewer, other members of the Editorial Board, the Vice Chairs, and the Editors-in-Chief to reach a consensus decision for each paper. The meta-reviewer then wrote a meta-review that summarized the discussion and the justification for the decision.

Articles submitted to this issue were reviewed by 145 members of the Editorial Board, five Vice Program Chairs, and four external reviewers. The submitted articles, reviews, and discussion were available to all members of the Editorial Board who did not have a conflict of interest with the authors of the article. To identify conflicts of interest, the membership of the Editorial Board was published before submissions were opened, and authors were asked to indicate members with whom any of the authors had a conflict. In addition, Editorial Board members were asked to list the authors and institutions with which they have conflicts of interest. Finally, the Editors-in-Chief also checked for missed conflicts. Editorial Board members were welcome to submit articles, while the Editors-in-Chief were precluded from doing so.

There were 200 submissions to this issue of PoPETs. Twenty-two of the 200 submissions had been invited during a previous issue to resubmit after major revision, and these were reassigned to the Editorial Board members that had reviewed the previous version. Additionally, twenty-nine articles that had been rejected from a previous issue were resubmitted to the journal, and they were reassigned to some of the same reviewers. For all these resubmissions, the authors provided a summary of changes made to the prior version that explained how review concerns had been addressed.

Of the 200 submissions, eight papers were accepted, and another 31 were conditionally accepted subject to minor revisions. For the latter, a reviewer was assigned as a shepherd to ensure that the important points from the meta-review were addressed. The identity of the shepherd was kept secret from the authors, and communication between the authors and the shepherd was done (anonymously) through our article submission system. Thirty-nine articles were ultimately accepted and form the articles published in this issue. These articles will be presented at PETS 2024.

The authors of 134 other articles were invited to resubmit to a future issue of PoPETs. For 52 of them, specific major revisions were requested, to be reviewed by the same reviewers when submitted to one of the following two PoPETs submission deadlines. The remaining 82 articles received a decision of Reject and Resubmit, as reviewers identified needed revisions that were unlikely to be successfully addressed in a short time. Twenty-two papers received a decision of Reject, either due to serious deficiencies or to being out of scope for PoPETs. Five submissions were rejected by the Editors-in-Chief without review by the Editorial Board for being out of scope, over the page limit, or non-anonymous. Finally, no

<sup>1</sup>The nomination form is available at <https://forms.gle/ykjGz39CG9QsFpoj6>.

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. To view a copy of this license visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/> or send a letter to Creative Commons, PO Box 1866, Mountain View, CA 94042, USA.



*Proceedings on Privacy Enhancing Technologies 2024(3), 1–3*

© 2024 Copyright held by the owner/author(s).

<https://doi.org/10.56553/popets-2024-0063>

submissions were withdrawn by the authors during the review process.

For the 2024 volume, we continue an artifact-review procedure to collect, evaluate, and distribute artifacts related to accepted papers (e.g. source code, datasets, machine-generated proofs, formal specifications, and build environments)<sup>2</sup>. Authors of accepted papers are encouraged (but not obliged) to submit their artifacts for review by an artifact-review committee. The committee performs some checks on artifact quality (e.g. documentation, licensing, and compilation); once approved, artifacts accompany the corresponding papers on the PETS website.

We thank the following people for making the third issue of PoPETs Volume 2024 possible:

*General Chair for PETS 2024:*

- Awais Rashid, University of Bristol

*Vice Program Chairs/Associate Editors-in-Chief:*

- Gunes Acar, Radboud University
- Sadia Afroz, ICSI
- Anna Maria Mandalari, Imperial College London
- Rebekah Overdorf, University of Lausanne
- Paul Syverson, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory

*Program Committee / Editorial Board:*

- Omer Akgul, University of Maryland
- Eman Alashwali, KAU & KAUST, Saudi Arabia and CMU, United States
- Ghada Almashaqbeh, University of Connecticut
- Mário Alvim, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais - UFMG
- Héber H. Arcolezi, Inria
- Hassan Asghar, Macquarie University
- Erman Ayday, Case Western Reserve University
- Sangwook Bae, Cape
- Harel Berger, Georgetown University
- Igor Bilogrevic, Google
- Eleanor Birrell, Pomona College
- Erik-Oliver Blass, Airbus
- Franziska Boenisch, University of Toronto and Vector Institute
- Jonas Böhrer, SAP SE
- Niklas Carlsson, Linköping University
- Sofia Celi, Brave Software
- Varun Chandrasekaran, University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign, Microsoft Research
- Rahul Chatterjee, University of Wisconsin-Madison
- Min Chen, CISA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Yimin (Ian) Chen, University of Massachusetts Lowell
- Francesco Ciclosi, University of Trento
- Shaanan Cohney, University of Melbourne
- Kovila Coopamootoo, King's College London
- Jean-François Couchot, FEMTO-ST Institute, Université de Franche-Comté
- Scott Coull, Google
- Jed Crandall, Arizona State University
- Ha Dao, Max Planck Institute for Informatics

- Debajyoti Das, KU Leuven
- Edwin Dauber, Widener University
- Alex Davidson, Universidade Nova de Lisboa
- Damien Desfontaines, Tumult Labs
- Nir Drucker, IBM Research - Israel
- Christoph Egger, Université Paris Cité, CNRS, IRIF
- Álvaro Feal, Northeastern University
- Ellis Fenske, US Naval Academy
- Imane Fouad, Inria
- Kevin Gallagher, NOVA LINCS, NOVA School of Science and Technology
- Sébastien Gambs, Université du Québec à Montréal (UQAM)
- Christina Garman, Purdue University
- Paolo Gasti, New York Institute of Technology
- Sepideh Ghanavati, University of Maine
- Badih Ghazi, Google Research
- Ian Goldberg, University of Waterloo
- Devashish Gosain, MPI-INF
- Rachel Greenstadt, NYU
- Johanna Gunawan, Northeastern University
- Cheng Guo, Clemson University / Google
- Emre Gürsoy, Koç University, Turkey
- Lucjan Hanzlik, CISA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Rakibul Hasan, Arizona State University
- Weijia He, Dartmouth College
- Urs Hengartner, University of Waterloo
- Martin Henze, RWTH Aachen University & Fraunhofer FKIE
- Dominik Herrmann, University of Bamberg, Germany
- Jens Hiller, Google
- Nguyen Phong Hoang, University of Chicago
- Thang Hoang, Virginia Tech
- Sanghyun Hong, Computer Science at Oregon State University
- Nick Hopper, University of Minnesota
- Rob Jansen, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory
- Jinyuan Jia, The Pennsylvania State University
- Bailey Kacsmar, University of Alberta
- Stefan Katzenbeisser, University of Passau, Germany
- Megha Khosla, TU Delft
- Nadim Kobeissi, Symbolic Software / Polygon Labs
- Konrad Kollnig, Maastricht University
- Chelsea Komlo, University of Waterloo
- Steve Kremer, Inria Nancy
- Dhruv Kuchhal, PayPal, Inc.
- Deepak Kumar, Stanford University
- Piyush Kumar Sharma, University of Michigan
- Alptekin Küpçü, Koç University
- Russell W. F. Lai, Aalto University
- Duc V. Le, Visa Research
- Hieu Le, UC Irvine
- Jaewoo Lee, University of Georgia
- Ming Li, The University of Texas at Arlington
- Kaitai Liang, Delft University of Technology
- Wouter Lueks, CISA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Ning Luo, Northwestern University

<sup>2</sup><https://petsymposium.org/artifacts.php>

- Jack P. K. Ma, Chinese University of Hong Kong
- Saeed Mahloujifar, FAIR, Meta AI
- Nathan Malkin, New Jersey Institute of Technology
- Sunil Manandhar, IBM T.J. Watson Research Center
- Pasin Manurangsi, Google Research
- Rahat Masood, The University of New South Wales (UNSW)
- Travis Mayberry, US Naval Academy
- Sebastian Meiser, University of Lübeck
- Ian Miers, University of Maryland
- Mohsen Minaei, Visa Research
- Meisam Mohammady, Iowa State University
- Victor Morel, Chalmers University of Technology
- Pedro Moreno-Sanchez, IMDEA Software Institute
- Sumit Mukherjee, insitro
- Steven Murdoch, University College London
- Jim Newsome, Tor Project
- Benjamin Nguyen, INSA Centre Val de Loire
- Catuscia Palamidessi, Inria
- Nisha Panwar, Augusta University
- Panagiotis Papadopoulos, iProov
- Tobias Pulls, Karlstad University, Sweden
- Reethika Ramesh, University of Michigan
- Vera Rimmer, DistriNet, KU Leuven
- Stefanie Roos, University of Kaiserslautern-Landau
- Giovanni Russello, University of Auckland
- Muhammad Saad, PayPal
- Reihaneh Safavi-Naini, University of Calgary
- Kavous Salehzadeh Niksirat, EPFL
- Adam Sealfon, Google
- William Seymour, King's College London
- Siamak Shahandashti, University of York
- Shawn Shan, University of Chicago
- Supreeth Shastri, King's College London
- Yan Shvartzshnaider, York University
- Sandra Siby, Imperial College London
- Tjerand Silde, Norwegian University of Science and Technology
- Lucy Simko, George Washington University
- Claudio Soriente, NEC Laboratories Europe
- Guillermo Suarez-Tangil, IMDEA Networks Institute
- Jose Such, King's College London & Universitat Politècnica de Valencia
- Ruoxi Sun, The University of Adelaide & CSIRO's Data61
- Wei Sun, UCSD
- Iraklis Symeonidis, RISE - Research Institutes of Sweden
- Mohammad Tahaei, Independent Researcher
- Daniel Takabi, Old Dominion University
- Ni Trieu, Arizona State University
- Anselme Tueno, SAP SE
- Nirvan Tyagi, Cornell University
- Benjamin Ujcich, Georgetown University
- Tobias Urban, Institute for Internet Security & secunet Security Networks AG
- Christine Utz, CISA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Tom Van Goethem, DistriNet, KU Leuven / Google

- Ryan Wails, Georgetown University, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory
- Ding Wang, Nankai University
- Haoyu Wang, Huazhong University of Science and Technology
- Jiafan Wang, CSIRO's Data61
- Liang Wang, Princeton University
- Miranda Wei, University of Washington
- Xusheng Xiao, Arizona State University
- Luyi Xing, Indiana University Bloomington
- Attila Yavuz, University of South Florida
- Haibin Zhang, Beijing Institute of Technology
- Zhikun Zhang, CISA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Zhiyi Zhang, Meta Inc
- Xiao Zhu, Google

*Publications Chairs:*

- Dhruv Kuchhal, Paypal, Inc.
- Pouneh Nikkhal Bahrami, University of California, Davis

*Artifact Chairs:*

- Pasin Manurangsi, Google Research
- Maximilian Noppel, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology

*Artifact Infrastructure Chair:*

- Tobias Fiebig, Max-Planck-Institut für Informatik

*Family Chair:*

- Nataliia Bielova, Inria Centre at Université Côte d'Azur

*Sponsorship Chairs:*

- Steven Murdoch, University College London
- Susan McGregor, Columbia University

*Publicity/Web Chairs:*

- Kat Hanna, The Tor Project
- Mathilde Raynal, EPFL

*Infrastructure Chairs:*

- Roger Dingledine, The Tor Project
- Ian Goldberg, University of Waterloo

*We thank the anonymous shepherds for their hard work.*

*We thank the following external reviewers:*

- Linkang Du, Zhejiang University
- Easwar Vivek Mangipudi, SupraOracles
- Kejsi Take, New York University
- Haiming Wang, Zhejiang University

Sincerely,

Micah Sherr and Zubair Shafiq

Co-Editors-in-Chief of PoPETs Volume 2024 and Program Co-Chairs of PETS 2024